

Message Text

SECRET

PAGE 01 MANILA 09145 01 OF 03 141108Z
ACTION SS-25

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 SSO-00 /026 W
-----141112Z 061207 /12
O 141045Z JUN 77
FM AMEMBASSY MANILA
TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 1093

S E C R E T SECTION 1 OF 3 MANILA 9145

EXDIS

FOR HOLBROOKE

E. O. 11652: GDS
TAGS: SHUM, RP
SUBJECT: HUMAN RIGHTS: DISCUSSION WITH PRESIDENT

REFS: A. STATE 132963; B. STATE 135544; C. MANILA 7791;
D. MANILA 9011

1. SUMMARY: I MET WITH PRESIDENT MARCOS JUNE 14 TO DISCUSS HUMAN RIGHTS PER REFTEL INSTRUCTIONS. CIRCUMSTANCES WERE NOT IDEAL; SINCE HE WAS DEPARTING FOR A MUST CEREMONY AND WE HAD ONLY TWENTY MINUTES. NONETHELESS, I DUMPED THE ENTIRE LOAD AND THEM SOME. MARCOS SAID HE WOULD PONDER MY REMARKS, AND WE COULD DISCUSS IT FURTHER BEFORE THE INTELLIGENCE BRIEFING SCHEDULED FOR JUNE 20. MARCOS' REACTION WAS ESSENTIALLY DEFENSIVE. IT WAS NOT AN EASY MEETING. END SUMMARY..

2. I OPENED BY REFERRING TO THE WORLD WAR II BATTLE OF BESANG PASS IN WHICH HE FOUGHT AND WHICH HE WAS COMMEMORATING IN CEREMONIES AT NOON TODAY. THAT EVOKED THE ONLY SMILE AND CHIT-CHAT OF OUR MEETING. I ADDED THAT MY TOPIC TODAY CONCERNED AN EVEN MORE CRUCIAL BATTLE YET TO BE FOUGHT, AGAINST EGREGIOUS ABUSES OF PERSONAL HUMAN RIGHTS. I NOTED MY SUBJECT HAD BECOME CONSIDERABLY MORE INVOLVED

SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 02 MANILA 09145 01 OF 03 141108Z

THAN WHEN ON JUNE 9 I HAD INITIALLY REQUESTED AN APPOINTMENT TO DISCUSS AN ORAL MESSAGE TO HIM FROM ASSISTANT SECRETARY HOLBROOKE. I SAID THAT SUBSEQUENTLY I HAD RECEIVED AN ANALYSIS OF RECENT INFORMATION AVAILABLE IN WASHINGTON CONCERNING HUMAN RIGHTS ABUSES WHICH I WOULD LIKE TO PRESENT IN SUMMARY, NOT ON INSTRUCTIONS, BUT IN AN EFFORT TO HELP HIM UNDERSTAND THE BACKGROUND AGAINST

WHICH THE WASHINGTON PERSPECTIVE ON HUMAN RIGHTS IN THE PHILIPPINE EVOLVES. THEREAFTER, I WOULD PASS TO HIM A RELATED SECOND MESSAGE FROM HOLBROOKE. FINALLY, IF HE STILL HAD THE TIME AND THE PATIENCE, AND I WAS STILL PERSONA GRATA, I WOULD LIKE TO ADD A FEW CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS ON MY OWN BEHALF. ALREADY LOOKING A LITTLE GRIM, MARCOS AGREED THAT I MIGHT PROCEED.

3. I READ TO MARCOS PARA 3A THROUGH C OF REF A, AND NOTING THAT I WAS AN ORAL MESSAGE, I NONETHELESS PASSED TO HIM A COURTESY COPY OF WHAT I HAD READ. BY WAY OF BACKGROUND I ALSO READ TO HIM PARA 2 OF REF A FROM THE FIRST SENTENCE, ALSO THE SECOND SENTENCE BEGINNING WITH "ALTHOUGH OBVIOUSLY" TO THE END, AND THE THIRD SENTENCE BEGINNING WITH "WE WISH" TO THE END, OMITTING MOST DELIBERATELY "BEFORE SECRETARY SENDS LETTER TO MARCOS AS YOU SUGGESTED." I ALSO READ PARA 2, IN ITS ENTIRETY, DELETING ONLY THE LAST THREE WORDS.

4. BEFORE PRESENTING THE "SUMMARY ANALYSIS," I RECALLED THAT PHILIPPINE-AMERICAN CULTURAL, INSTITUTIONAL AND PERSONAL CONTACTS ARE BOTH INTENSIVE AND EXTENSIVE, HERE AND IN THE U.S., DIRECTLY AND THROUGH THIRD PARTIES. THESE CONTACTS, INCLUDING AS THEY DO GOVERNMENT, CHURCH, BUSINESS, ACADEMIC, MILITARY, VETERANS, FAMILY, ETC. CONSTITUTE A VERITABLE INTERPENETRATION OF SOCIETIES, AND AS A CONSEQUENCE AND NOT SURPRISINGLY A LOT OF INFORMATION AND OPINION MOVES BACK AND FORTH. WITH HUMAN RIGHTS MUCH IN THE NEWS, IT ALSO IS NOT SURPRISING THAT THE SUBJECT
SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 03 MANILA 09145 01 OF 03 141108Z

SHOULD BE AN IMPORTANT FOCUS OF SUCH INTERCHANGE. NOTING THAT AN ATTEMPT HAS BEEN MADE TO ANALYZE SOME OF THE MOST RECENT AND CREDIBLE OF SUCH INFORMATION AVAILABLE IN WASHINGTON AND PERTAINING TO THE PRACTICE OF TORTURE, I PRESENTED THE "RESULTS" IN SUMMARY AS FOLLOWS.

A. METROCOM IS PERMEATED FROM THE TOP DOWN BY PERSONNEL, ATTITUDES AND PRACTICES THAT CONDONE, SUPPORT AND PROTECT THE REGULAR USE OF TORTURE TO EXTRACT INFORMATION FROM PRISONERS.

B. THE PRACTICE OF TORTURE OCCURS NOT ONLY IN THE MANILA AREA BUT ALSO AND MOST ESPECIALLY IN THE PROVINCES WHERE PHILIPPINE CONSTABULARY UNITS TAKE THEIR CUE FROM THE

SECRET

NNN

SECRET

PAGE 01 MANILA 09145 02 OF 03 141101Z
ACTION SS-25

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 SSO-00 /026 W
-----141110Z 061124 /13

O 141045Z JUN 77
FM AMEMBASSY MANILA
TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 1094

S E C R E T SECTION 2 OF 3 MANILA 9145

EXDIS

FOR HOLBROOKE

METROCOM MODEL.

C. NO ONE BELIEVES THAT ONLY TWO LIEUTENANTS AND ONE
ENLISTED MAN ARE RESPONSIBLE FOR THE TORTURE OF MRS.
HERRERA; INDEED THE IDENTITY OF THE SUPERVISING CAPTAIN
AND OTHER SENIORS INVOLVED IS WIDELY KNOWN.

D. EVERYONE EXPECTS THE HERRERA INVESTIGATION AND
COURT-MARTIAL TO BE RESISTED EVERY STEP OF THE WAY BY
METROCOM AND FAILING THAT TO HAVE THE SENTENCES COMMUTED
AS IS CUSTOMARY IN SUCH CASES, E.G., ONE LIEUTENANT "HOT
IRON" SPECIALIST A YEAR AGO, AND ONE NOTORIOUS MAJOR WHO
NEVER WAS COURT-MARTIALED. MARCOS ASKED FOR THE NAMES,
AND I SAID I HAD THEM BUT NOT WITH ME AND, IN ANY EVENT,
I WAS NOT DETAILING ALLEGATIONS BUT THAT THESE
APPARENTLY ARE WIDELY HELD OPINIONS.

E. A MAJOR CONCLUSION BEING DRAWN BY THE INTELLIGENCE
SERVICES AND UNITS CONCERNED IS THAT IT IS BEST TO EXECUTE
PERSONS AFTER TORTURE; SINCE "DEAN MEN/WOMEN TELL NO TALES."
THE IDEA OF ESHEWING TORTURE DOES NOT SEEM TO BE GETTING
ACROSS.

SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 02 MANILA 09145 02 OF 03 141101Z

5. I COMMENTED THAT:

A. THERE IS MORE SUCH INFORMATION IN MUCH MORE DETAIL
AND FROM SO MANY SOURCES AS TO BE MOST PERSUASIVE.

B. WE DO NOT PRESUME, OF COURSE, TO INVESTIGATE CASES, DETAIL CHARGES OR SUGGEST SPECIFIC REMEDIES. ONLY HE CAN DO THAT.

C. WE DO, HOWEVER, SEE TORTURE AS A SERIOUS AND EXPLOSIVE PROBLEM IN OUR RELATIONS.

I THEN READ HOLBROOKE'S SECOND MESSAGE (REFTEL B) BEGINNING IN THE SECOND SENTENCE FROM "I SUGGEST" TO THE END OF THE TEXT.

6. I MADE THE FOLLOWING "PERSONAL" OBSERVATIONS:

A. IF AMY EWDGMENT, HUMAN RIGHTS IS THE ONE MAJOR ISSUE THAT CAN UNDERMINE EVERYTHING ELSE IN PHILIPPINE-AMERICAN RELATIONS.

B. AT THE SAME TIME IT IS A MAJOR OPPORTUNITY QUALITATIVELY EVEN DRAMATICALLY TO IMPROVE THOSE RELATIONS. HE ALREADY HAS TAKEN SEVERAL SIGNIFICANT STEPS IN THAT DIRECTIONS.

C. I THINK HE KNOWS THAT I HAVE BEEN WORKING TOWARD IMPROVEMENTS. I EVEN PUT DOWN ON PAPER SOME OF MY OWN IDEAS ABOUT A SHORT-TERM STRATEGY FOR DEALING WITH THE PROBLEM WHICH I DISCUSSED WITH MRS. MARCOS AT LUNCHEON ON MAY 21 (REFTEL C). MARCOS ACKNOWLEDGED THAT HIS WIFE HAD MENTIONED THAT DISCUSSION AND HAD GIVEN HIM A COPY OF MY PAPER. HOWEVER, SEEING THAT I HAD THE PAPER IN HAND, HE ASKED IF HE MIGHT HAVE ANOTHER COPY. NOTING THE REFERENCE IN THE PAPER TO THE LONG-STANDING CAUSE CELEBRE OF AQUINO/
SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 03 MANILA 09145 02 OF 03 141101Z

LOPEZ ET AL, MARCOS SAID THAT SINCE THE CASE HAD ATTRACTED SO MUCH ATTENTION, IT WOULD BE NECESSARY TO LET THE TRIAL RUN ITS COURSE.

7. STILL IN THE "PERSONAL" MODE I SAID THAT I THINK I CAN REPORT THAT WASHINGTON WANTS TO BELIEVE THAT IN HIM IT HAS A SUPPORTER AND ALLY IN THE PROMOTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS. SOME OF OUR PEOPLE EVIDENTLY ARE ENCOURAGED; OTHERS REMAIN SKEPTICAL. THE PROBLEM, OF COURSE, IS CREDIBILITY. THERE ARE TWO ASPECTS:

A. CONTRARY REPORTS: AS PREVIOUSLY NOTED, AND

B. INCONSISTENCIES AND GAPS IN THE LOGIC OF THE PHILIPPINE SITUATION, E.G., IT IS DOUBTFUL ON THE FACE OF IT THAT ONLY THREE RELATIVELY JUNIOR MILITARY PERSONNEL TORTURED

MRS. HERRERA WITHOUT THE KNOWLEDGE, SUPPORT OF ACQUIESCENCE OF OTHERS, INCLUDING THOSE MORE SENIOR. MARCOS INTERJECTED THAT ONLY THE THREE HAD BEEN IDENTIFIED. THIS CREDIBILITY GAP, I SAID, SEEMS TO ME TO MAKE IT ALL THE MORE NECESSARY VIGOROUSLY AND PERSISTENTLY TO ROOT OUT ABUSES OF HUMAN RIGHTS, PARTICULARLY THE MOST EGREGIOUS ABUSES, AND MOST ESPECIALLY ACTS AGAINST THE PERSON, TORTURE AND SUCH. TORTURE WILL OUT, THAT IS A FACT OF LIFE, AND A HEALTHY VENTILATION WITHIN A SOCIETY. IT CAN BE A GOOD THING. AFTER ALL, PRESIDENT CARTER WAS ELECTED AS THE SPOKESMAN OF A NO LONGER SILENT MAJORITY APPALLED BY WATERGATE. MORE SPECIFICALLY, I SUGGESTED, CONSIDER THE WORLD PEACE THROUGH LAW CONFERENCE SCHEDULED TO BE HELD IN MANILA WITH THOUSANDS OF JURISTS ATTENDING. THEY WILL COME TO KNOW ABOUT SUCH MATTERS. THEY ALSO WILL BE MADE

SECRET

NNN

SECRET

PAGE 01 MANILA 09145 03 OF 03 141123Z
ACTION SS-25

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 SSO-00 /026 W
-----141126Z 061354 /13

O 141045Z JUN 77
FM AMEMBASSY MANILA
TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 1095

SECRET SECTION 3 OF 3 MANILA 9145

EXDIS

FOR HOLBROOKE

AWARE OF ANY VIGOROUS AND EFFECTIVE EFFORTS TO DEAL WITH THE PROBLEM.

8. I CONCLUDED WITH THE OBSERVATION THAT I TRUST MARCOS UNDERSTANDS THAT WHAT I SAID TODAY HAS BEEN SAID AS A FRIEND, THAT I WANT AND INTEND TO BE HELPFUL, AND THAT I AM PREPARED TO GO TO BAT WHENEVER AND WHEREVER THE RECORD PERMITS.

9. IN THE BRIEF RESPONSE THAT FOLLOWED, MARCOS DENIED WHAT HE TOOK WAS THE IMPLICATIONS THAT TORTURE IS AN APPROVED POLICY AND NOT AN ABERRATION WITHIN THE PHILIPPINE MILITARY FORCES. HE SAID HE COULDN'T ACCEPT THAT THE

MILITARY FORCES WERE GENERALLY INVOLVED. THE MILITARY IS NOT SO BAD, HE SAID, THEY COULDN'T BE AND STILL HAVE PROVEN SO EFFECTIVE AGAINST THE GUERRILLAS. MOREOVER, THE PHILIPPINE PEOPLE WOULDN'T STAND FOR THAT KIND OF BEHAVIOR. I REPLIED THAT THE CONTENTION IS RATHER THAT TORTURE APPEARS TO BE AN ACCEPTED PRACTICE WITHIN CERTAIN ELEMENTS AND UNITS, MOST PARTICULARLY METROCOM. MARCOS SAID THIS WAS THE CONTENTION OF AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL, WHICH HE REJECTED. AT THE SAME TIME, HE ACKNOWLEDGED THAT SUCH PRACTICES MIGHT OCCUR AS ABERRATIONS DOWN THE LINE IN METROCOM. I SAID
SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 02 MANILA 09145 03 OF 03 141123Z

THAT THE SUGGESTION SEEMS TO BE THAT SUCH PRACTICES WERE CONDONED OR AT LEAST ACQUIESCED IN BY METROCOM FROM THE TOP DOWN. MARCOS THEN REFERRED VAGUELY TO APPARENTLY PREVIOUS ALLEGATIONS ABOUT METROCOM COMMANDER BRIGADER GENERAL OLIVARES WHICH, HOWEVER, HAD BEEN DISMISSED FOR LACK OF SUBSTANCE, AND MUSED THAT PERHAPS THEY WOULD HAVE TO BE REEXAMINED.

10. MARCOS ALSO WONDERED ABOUT THE REPORTS FROM WHICH THE "SUMMARY ANALYSIS" WAS DERIVED. HE ASKED FOR DETAILS, CHAPTER AND VERSE, THAT HE COULD ACT UPON. I SAID THAT HE WAS IN THE BEST POSITION TO GET AT THE FACTS OF THE SITUATION. REVEALINGLY PERHAPS, HE DISAGREED, NOTING THAT FILIPINOS MIGHT BE MORE WILLING TO REGISTER SUCH COMPLAINTS WITH US THAN GO TO THE PHILIPPINE AUTHORITIES AND RISK RETRIBUTION. MARCOS THEN ASKED AGAIN IF WE COULD PROVIDE HIM WITH SOMETHING TO WORK WITH "NOT SOURCES, BUT LEADS" THAT COULD BE FOLLOWED UP BY HIM. I PROMISED TO REPORT THIS REQUEST WHILE AT THE SAME TIME NOTING MY DOUBTS THAT IT WOULD BE CONSIDERED AN APPROPRIATE FUNCTION FOR US TO BECOME INVOLVED IN.

10. COMMENT: MARCOS REMAINED COLLECTED, AS MIGHT BE EXPECTED, THROUGHOUT THE DISCUSSION, EVEN NOTABLY SO CONSIDERING THE SENSITIVITY OF THE SUBJECT MATTER, THE DECIDELY FIRM, IF FRIENDLY, PRESENTATION, AND THE HOBSON CHOICES IT POSES FOR HIM. NONETHELESS, I DETECTED SOME CONSIDERABLE AGITATION BENEATH THE CONTROLLED EXTERIOR. I CONSIDER IT TO HAVE BEEN A MAKE OR BREAK DISCUSSION AND REGRET THAT IT DID NOT TAKE PLACE UNDER MORE AUSPICIOUS CIRCUMSTANCES. BUT THE LIMITED TIME AVAILABLE MAY EVEN PROVE ADVANTAGEOUS BY GIVING MARCOS AN INTERVAL TO PONDER WHAT WAS SAID BEFORE MAKING A MORE DEFINITIVE RESPONSE. IN ANY EVENT, HE DID NOT THROW ME OUT OF THE OFFICE, AND I AM MIDLY ENCOURAGED BY HIS SUGGESTION THAT WE DISCUSS THE MATTER FURTHER PRIOR TO THE INTELLIGENCE BRIEFING WE
SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 03 MANILA 09145 03 OF 03 141123Z

HAVE SCHEDULED FOR HIM ON JUNE 20.

11. AS REPORTED REF D, I BELIEVE IT IS ESSENTIAL THAT WE GET ACROSS TO MARCOS THAT "TORTURE WILL OUT" ALONG WITH OTHER EGREGIOUS ABUSES OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND THAT THE ONLY WAY TO PROTECT HIMSELF AGAINST SUCH DAMAGING DISCLOSURES WILL BE TO GO HARD AFTER THE ABUSES. I CONSIDER THAT THE FIRST PORTION OF THAT PROPOSITION PROBABLY WAS FIRMLY ESTABLISHED IN THE DISCUSSION TODAY. AT LEAST MARCOS HAS BEEN PUT FAIRLY ON NOTICE. AS TO THE SECOND PORTION, IT REMAINS TO BE SEEN HOW HE WILL FACE UP TO THE INEVITABLE CHOICE OF MOVING DECISIVELY TO ROOT OUT THE EGREGIOUS ABUSES OR OF SUFFERING THE CONSTRAINTS AND HAZARDS THAT SUCH PRACTICES CONSTITUTE IN HIS RELATIONS WITH THE CARTER ADMINISTRATION.

12. HERETOFORE, MARCOS MAY HAVE ASSUMED THAT HE COULD DAMPEN DOWN THESE ABUSES OF PERSONAL RIGHTS FOR THE BENEFIT OF THE AMERICANS, WHILE RETAINING THE "SECURITY BENEFITS" OF CONFESSIONS EXTRACTED UNDER THE EXPECTATION, THREAT AND FACT OF TORTURE, AND AVOIDING AN UNPLEASANT CONFRONTATION WITH OLD CRONIES AND VALUED INTELLIGENCE OFFICERS. WE HAVE NOW IN EFFECT TOLD HIM THAT THERE NO LONGER IS ANY PLACE TO HIDE. THIS COMBINED WITH OUR PREVIOUS ASSERTION OF ABSOLUTE COMMITMENT TO HUMAN RIGHTS AND HIS OWN RECENT SPLENDID RHETORIC ON THE SUBJECT, PUTS HIM VERY MUCH ON THE SPOT. IF HE OPTS TO MOVE TOWARD AND WITH US, MANILA COULD BE A VERY PLEASANT ASSIGNMENT FOR THE NEXT AMERICAN AMBASSADOR, IF NOT, EVEN THIS MERE CHARGE D'AFFAIRES A.I. MAY FIND HIS PERSONAL CAPITAL WITH THE REGIME WEARING RAPIDLY THIN.

13. MEANWHILE, I WOULD APPRECIATE THE DEPARTMENT'S GUIDANCE AS TO HOW TO RESPOND TO MARCOS' REQUEST FOR LEADS TO HELP HIM ROOT OUT ABUSES OF HUMAN RIGHTS. THE SUGGESTION SEEMS DISINGENUOUS OR DESPARATE, AND WOULD SEEM IN EFFECT
SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 04 MANILA 09145 03 OF 03 141123Z

TO SHIFT THE INITIAL BURDEN TO US. I DON'T SEE HOW WE CAN ACCEPT THAT, BUT WOULD BE INTERESTED IN HEARING THE DEPARTMENT'S VIEWS, HOPEFULLY BEFORE JUNE 20.

STULL

SECRET

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: Z
Capture Date: 01-Jan-1994 12:00:00 am
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: HUMAN RIGHTS, DIPLOMATIC DISCUSSIONS, FOREIGN POLICY POSITION
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Sent Date: 14-Jun-1977 12:00:00 am
Decaption Date: 22 May 2009
Decaption Note: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 22 May 2009
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1977MANILA09145
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: n/a
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: GS
Errors: N/A
Expiration:
Film Number: D770211-1008
Format: TEL
From: MANILA
Handling Restrictions:
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1977/newtext/t19770660/aaaabzzy.tel
Line Count: 383
Litigation Code IDs:
Litigation Codes:
Litigation History:
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM
Message ID: 0a9bc97d-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Office: ACTION SS
Original Classification: SECRET
Original Handling Restrictions: EXDIS
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 7
Previous Channel Indicators: n/a
Previous Classification: SECRET
Previous Handling Restrictions: EXDIS
Reference: 77 STATE 132963, 77 STATE 135544, 77 MANILA 7791, 77 MANILA 9011
Retention: 0
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 23-Feb-2005 12:00:00 am
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review Media Identifier:
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
SAS ID: 2163288
Secure: OPEN
Status: NATIVE
Subject: HUMAN RIGHTS: DISCUSSION WITH PRESIDENT
TAGS: SHUM, RP, US, (MARCOS, FERDINAND)
To: STATE
Type: TE
vdkgvwkey: odb://SAS/SAS.dbo.SAS_Docs/0a9bc97d-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Review Markings:
Margaret P. Grafeld
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
22 May 2009
Markings: Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009